

UNIVERSITY OF COLORADO SCHOOL OF MEDICINE
PROMOTION CRITERIA MATRIX
Revised 9/7/2012

NOTE: The following is intended to present examples of various levels of accomplishment in the areas of teaching, research, clinical activity, scholarship and service. It is not exclusionary, but is intended to assist faculty, department chairs and promotion committees in matching candidates' accomplishments to the promotion criteria. Moreover, areas frequently overlap in practice, although they are presented as distinct entities here. It should also be noted that the matrix specifies just two categories, meritorious and excellent. Professors will need to achieve excellence by a number of criteria. Associate professors will have met fewer of these criteria or in not as great depth. The promotion process is meant to describe and reward continued professional growth and achievement.

TEACHING	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Active participation in teaching activities of the department, school, campus or university, including two or more of the following: presenting a series of lectures covering one or more topics; coordinating a course; acting as a primary instructor in a course; advising or mentoring students, residents or faculty; attending on an inpatient or outpatient service; organizing or facilitating a seminar series, journal clubs or laboratory exercises; participating as a teacher in continuing education activities.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of teaching duties –in classroom, laboratory, clinical or community settings.
	Consistently receives outstanding teaching evaluations or teaching awards.
	Recognition as an outstanding and influential role model for students, fellows, residents or other trainees.
Meritorious teaching evaluations from students and peers.	Record of successful mentorship of students, residents, fellows or other faculty, as measured by: letters of support from mentees; publications, presentations, grants, awards or other evidence of mentees' academic success; evidence that mentees have pursued outstanding careers.
Development or redevelopment of teaching materials for students, continuing education courses or other faculty training.	
Invitations to present Grand Rounds or seminars here or at other institutions; invitations to present lectures or courses outside of primary department.	Development of mentoring programs that focus on career development or academic promotion of students, residents, fellows or faculty.
Self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or courses that are designed to improve teaching or mentoring effectiveness).	Development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops.
Participation as a mentor on a training grant.	Successful leadership of local, regional or national continuing education courses.

APPENDIX 1

TEACHING (continued)	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
	Consistent participation in national educational activities (for example, residency review committees, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification courses or workshops).
	Invitations to be a visiting professor at other institutions.
	Development of innovative courses, high-quality syllabi, novel lectures, problem-based learning cases, laboratory exercises or other instructional materials.
	Demonstration of educational leadership (for example, by serving as a course, fellowship or training program director or assistant dean).
	Evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants, publications or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, or outcomes, of teaching).
	Completion of advanced faculty development programs that result in a certificate or degree in education, with evidence that the faculty member has applied these new skills or new knowledge to improve his or her teaching or pedagogy.

CLINICAL ACTIVITY	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Active and effective participation in the clinical activities of the academic unit.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of clinical duties, as measured by patient care or procedure logs, RVUs, clinical billing statistics or other measures of clinical effort.
Board certification or recertification.	
Demonstration of clinical skills that are highly effective (e.g., mastery of important clinical techniques, high degree of patient satisfaction, evidence of high quality and efficient patient care).	Continuing, significant participation for an extended period of time in clinical activities that are highly effective.
Support from peers at the site of practice.	Development of new techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, patient care practices or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.
Invitations to speak on clinical topics on campus, or participation on institutional clinical care committees.	
Active participation in activities that promote health care quality and patient safety.	Creative, active participation in the evaluation of the effectiveness of care (quality, outcomes, patient safety, utilization, access, cost).
Completion of self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or continuing medical education activities that are designed to improve knowledge or clinical skills).	Recognition for excellence in clinical activity at the local, regional, national or international level through letters of reference, honors, awards, institutional evaluations, invitations to speak or requests to write reviews.
	Demonstration of effective leadership at the site of clinical practice – e.g., director of a clinical service, head of a division, chair of a department, head of an interdisciplinary team that creates and manages a clinical pathway and outcomes evaluation, medical staff president.
	Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the regional level – e.g., chairing committees, or serving as officer of local or statewide professional organizations.
	Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the national or international level - e.g., chairing national symposia and meetings, chairing committees or serving as officer of national professional organizations, journal editor.
	Leadership of structured activities that promote quality of care and patient safety and that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.

CLINICAL ACTIVITY (continued)

	<u>Excellent</u>
	Participation in significant self-assessment activities and audits of one's own practice that have led to improvements in quality, efficiency or outcomes of care.
	Significant involvement in health care advocacy, community service or other activities that shape public policy on health care or that address health disparities.
	Evidence of health care-related scholarship (for example, grants, publications, authoritative review articles, national presentations, innovations or other activities that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement).

RESEARCH	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Authorship of papers in peer-reviewed journals that demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses and represent a significant contribution to the published literature.	A consistent level of peer-reviewed or other funding for research awarded in a competitive manner over a sustained period of time.
Co-investigator status on grants.	Demonstrated evidence of originality as an investigator.
A principal and sustained role in the management of a research program with external funding.	Demonstration of significant independent intellectual contributions to successful research programs.
Development of patents or discoveries.	Principal investigator status on competitive peer-reviewed research grants (for example: R03 or R21 awards or mentored K08 or K23 awards from NIH or private foundations for associate professors; R01, P01 or other independent awards for professors).
Presentations at national meetings; invited research seminars at this and other institutions; service as an ad hoc member on study sections.	
	Development of a significant number of patents.
	An ongoing, peer-reviewed publication record with first- or senior-author publications.
	A national or international reputation, as evidenced by: external letters of reference; invitations to present at national or international meetings; invitations to write authoritative reviews or chapters, or to provide unique expertise as a collaborator on a research project; visiting professorships; service on as a regular member on study sections; leadership of national meetings; service as a national consultant or on editorial boards of journals.

SERVICE	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Service on committees or task forces within the program, division, department, school, campus or university.	Appointment to responsible positions within the institution such as: chair of a committee; faculty officer; program director; academic clinical coordinator; membership on major decision-making Anschutz Medical Campus committees.
Service to local, state, national or international organizations through education, consultation or other roles.	Service as an officer or committee chair in professional or scientific organizations.
	Service on editorial boards of professional or scientific journals.
	Election to responsible positions dealing with health care issues at the local, state, regional, national or international levels.
	Service awards from the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific or professional).

SCHOLARSHIP

There may be considerable overlap between scholarship and the other areas (research, teaching and clinical activity). However, as defined in the Rules, the products of all scholarship must be in a format that can be evaluated, which would normally mean a written format, but could include video or computer formats.

CLINICAL RESEARCH

<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Serves as a collaborator in research, program (e.g., a participant in a multicenter trial).	Designs and directs research and plays a major role in writing up the results. Ongoing record of first- or senior-author on publications.
Establishes an area of research in a clinical area. On-going record of research publications.	Coordinates research at a national or international level in a multicenter study.
Conducts applied research including evaluation of the efficacy of various treatment modalities.	Consistent funding for peer-reviewed or other equivalent research.
Facilitates the research programs of the SOM through substantive contributions to COMIRB, which must include: regular attendance at meetings over at least a three-year period; active and effective participation in discussions; review and presentations of protocols to the committee; and a demonstrated understanding of key topics (e.g. informed consent, risk assessment, protection of vulnerable populations, adverse event reporting or waivers of informed consent). Additional aspects of COMIRB service that may be considered evidence of meritorious scholarship may include: mentoring of new COMIRB members in the elements of proper review and presentation of protocols; active participation in COMIRB “education days;” training of SOM clinical investigators in techniques of protocol writing; and serving as a positive spokesperson for COMIRB service. A supporting letter from the Director of COMIRB is required.	Multiple publications in area of expertise.
	Member of review section or editorial board.
	National reputation.

<i>INNOVATIVE PROCEDURES FOR THE DELIVERY OF HEALTH CARE</i>	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Initiates improvements in delivery within the institution.	Initiates improvements that have improved the delivery of health care nationally or internationally.
Provides documentation of intervention(s) and outcome(s).	Consistent funding for peer-reviewed health services research.
Documents improvements to audiences outside the Anschutz Medical Campus, typically in the form of written communications.	Utilized as a national or international consultant in area of expertise.
	Multiple publications on subject.
<i>WRITING OF MONOGRAPHS, REVIEWS, AND OTHER CREATIVE EFFORTS</i>	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Publication or dissemination of review articles or reports that integrate knowledge and put new discoveries into perspective.	The reviews represent a major body of work that provides a documentable national or international reputation.
<i>TEACHING SCHOLARSHIP</i>	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Develops new educational materials.	Creates a new course or curriculum.
Publishes articles on health professional education with emphasis on hypothesis-driven research.	A strong record of publications in health professional education.
Facilitates the educational programs of the SOM through ongoing and substantive contributions to the Student Admissions Committee, Participation must include submission of end-of-year reports reflecting on knowledge and insights gained from admissions committee meetings and applicant interviews or discussion of applicant recruitment, measures of applicant readiness, premed advising, pipeline activities, class diversity or other relevant challenges and topics. A supporting letter from the Associate Dean for Admissions is required.	

CLINICAL SCHOLARSHIP	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Provides continuing education at local and national meetings.	Ongoing record of peer-reviewed grant funding.
Participation in departmental, divisional, and institutional quality assurance programs.	Design and directs hypothesis-driven research.
Presentation of invited grand rounds locally.	Development of new techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, patient care pathways or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.
Ongoing record of publishing works of scholarly integration, such as case studies, book chapters and reviews.	Leadership in the design, conduct and publication of clinical research, including clinical trials.
Written documentation of novel techniques in teaching on the delivery of care.	A strong record of peer-reviewed publications that focus on clinical topics or quality improvement.
Documentation of innovative quality assurance programs.	Contributions to books, journals or clinical information systems.
Collaborator in design, conduct and publication of research, e.g., a participant in a multicenter trial.	Other evidence of clinical scholarship (for example, research, grants, publications or national presentations) that promote health care quality and patient safety or that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.

BASIC SCIENCE SCHOLARSHIP	
<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Writes articles integrating knowledge in a field and assesses overall value of discoveries in relationship to the area of research.	Initiates and designs the research protocol.
Service on committees or task forces within the program, division, department, school, campus or university.	Coordinates research at a national level in a multi-center study.
Service to local, state, national or international organizations through education, consultation or other roles.	Directs research and plays a major role in writing up the results. Senior author on publications.
	Consistent funding for peer-reviewed research.
	Multiple publications on area of expertise.
	Member of review section or editorial board.
	Appointment to responsible positions within the institution such as chair of a committee; faculty officer; program director; academic clinical coordinator; membership on major decision-making Anschutz Medical Campus committees.
	Service as an officer or committee chair in professional or scientific organizations.
	Service on editorial boards of professional or scientific journals.
	Election to responsible positions dealing with health care issues at the local, state, regional, national or international levels.
	Service awards from an area of the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific and/or professional).